Attachment No. 2.

Alternative Locations Analysis

Alternative Location Analysis:

Note: Locations and some comments (indicated in italics) are derived from the *Statements of Heritage Impact, Planning & Heritage Submission* David Denman & Associates prepared for the Development Application to Northern Midlands Council and Tasmanian Heritage Council. The discussion has been extended due to the detailed knowledge of the site held by the author of this document.

Prior to and at the time of the location selection there was a detailed discussion as to the best location for the new building. The discussion was centred around heritage impact on Outstanding Universal Values for associated with World Heritage listing, visual impact on the site, strategic location that would satisfy the logistics of site access and the opportunity to create the visual connection with Brickendon.

Seven alternative locations were considered in addition to the proposed site. These are identified 1-7 as follows:

Location Option 1: Store

The existing Visitor Centre and offices are located in the pre 1826 **Store Building**. It is not considered prudent to retain the facility in this building for the following reasons:

- 1. The building is too small to accommodate the present and future needs considered essential for a visitor centre.
- 2. The long term impact this use will have on the fabric of the building.
- 3. The building is too far away from the proposed new public vehicle access road and car parking.
- 4. Ticketing and retail are located in the historic Store building. The building is compromised on a number of levels interpretation of the original use of the building, intensive impact on building fabric, altered spaces, limited access to the spaces due to present day uses, access for people with disabilities is not available for visitors to this point of entry.
- 5. The best possible commercial outcome for the Estate is for visitors to enter and leave a site is through the retail outlet, to enable the site to capture the maximum income. Currently the site is losing potential income due to a cramped and poorly planned space in the retail area that is also trying to operate as a ticketing facility.
- 6. Storage for retail and administration offices are scattered between the Store and the Caretakers Quarters above the Servants Kitchen. This creates inefficiencies in time and ineffectiveness in management.
- 7. The ground floor of the Store is presented as artificially divided by partitioned spaces across the once expanse open ground floor. The office spaces do not comply with the Building Code of Australia or Workplace Health and Safety legislation.

In brief: The Store is no longer appropriate for use as the entrance to the site. It is too limited in size, capacity, potential impact on heritage fabric and values and the loss of a key building that contributes to the key World Heritage story of assignment and master/convict relationship.

Location Option 2: Farm Stables Building

It is not considered prudent to house the facility in this building for the following reasons:

- 1. The CMP nominated the **Farm Stables Building** as being suitable for adaptation for use as a new visitors centre. However the building would need extensive additions to provide the required floor area to accommodate the facilities required by the project brief. There are also issues associated with the public vehicle access that would result in unacceptable impacts on the heritage values of the Farm Stables and associated cottage precinct.
- 2. The Farm Stables Building is a fine example of the hierarchy of work and management employed at Woolmers Estate in the 19th Century. In comparison to the Coach House the Farm Stables or Working Horse Stables was regarded a lesser building and purely utilitarian. The Coach House in comparison was located centrally to the homestead, designed in a grand manner to reflect the architectural style of the estate and housed the fine coach horses used for display. The Farm Stables were located away from the homestead, located near the workers cottages for convenience and housed the farm equipment and working horses.

In brief: The Farm Stables Building is not appropriate for use as the entrance to the site. It is too limited in size, capacity. The impact on heritage fabric and values and the loss of a significant building that contributes to the key World Heritage story of assignment and master/convict relationship would have a major impact on the Estate.

Location Option 3: Rear of the Woolshed & Cider Press

This location was considered and deemed not suitable for the following reasons:

- 1. The new building would be too prominent and therefore have an unacceptable visual impact on the outbuilding precinct.
- 2. The paddock behind the Woolshed is important to the Estates spatial context with the outbuildings.
- 3. Vehicular access and visitor parking would be too intrusive to service this location.
- 4. The Woolshed and Cider press holds a level of significance within the national context in their own right. It would be completely inappropriate to place another building in close proximity as the reading of the historic buildings within the farm context would be lost.

Location Option 4: Adjoining existing vehicle entrance, south of the car-park

This location was considered and deemed not suitable for the following reasons:

- 1. It is proposed to relocate the existing main vehicle entrance off Woolmers Lane and remove the existing visitor car-park and reinstate this part of the estate.
- 2. Any new facility would be too far removed from vehicle access and visitor parking from the new entrance.
- 3. The building would be visible from Woolmer's Lane and therefore detract from the historic setting of the place.

4. Tasmanian government Department of Infrastructure Energy & Resources (DIER) will not allow an entrance to the site from Woolmer's Lane in any other location than that to the south of the Woolmers Cottage entrance which is a significant distance from the core site. A facility in this option would be disjointed and dysfunctional.

Location Option 5: South of the Proposed Site

This location was considered and deemed not suitable for the following reasons:

- 1. The new building would be too prominent and therefore have an unacceptable visual impact on the outbuilding precinct.
- 2. The paddock behind the Woolshed is important to the Estates special context with the outbuildings.
- 3. Vehicle access and visitor parking would be too intrusive to service this location.
- 4. The location is clearly inappropriate however it has led to a design solution that will provide a solution that conceals itself around the Rose Garden perimeter. The demands of DIER dictate the outcomes in regard to the compromises of proximity to the core precinct and the access.

Location Option 6: East of the proposed new vehicle entrance drive

This location would be the least intrusive; and most economical site to build, however it was deemed not suitable for the following reasons:

- 1. The problems associated with managing the site from so far away from the historic building precincts.
- 2. The problems associated with getting visitors to the historic building precincts. (a shuttle bus or similar would be required).
- 3. The isolated location would create security issues. The Estate is accessible from a number of locations: Macquarie River, Woolmer's Lane, neighbouring properties. The Estate holds valuable collections that are irreplaceable.

Location Option 7: Woolmer's Cottage

This location was considered and deemed not suitable for the following reasons:

- 1. There is not sufficient space in this building to meet the requirements of the project brief.
- 2. The cottage has recently been restored and no further adaptation or integration of the existing spaces is permitted.
- 3. External additions would not be permitted.
- 4. Woolmer's Cottage is a highly significant building within the Estate and contributes greatly to the story. To impose such a use on the building would have an irreversible impact on heritage fabric and diminish its significance.
- 5. The layout of Woolmer's Cottage is a microcosm of the main homestead design. The upstairs roof space was designed to house convict women at night. Much of the evidence still exists in the form of original building fabric. These women were used for domestic duties at the Cottage.

